

### Lloyd's and litigation on the Continent

Understanding Lloyd's AIDA Swiss Chapter Event

Lars Gerspacher
7 December 2015

### Lloyd's Underwriters as defendants



- Any litigant (claimant or defendant) requires legal capacity.
- Legal capacity not dealt with by neither the Lugano Convention, nor the EU Regulation 1215/12 (Brussel Ia).
- Usual clause if the Lloyd's Policy is governed by Swiss law:
- **A.** The Underwriters and contractual partners of the Policyholder (hereafter: "the Policyholder") are underwriting members of the association of underwriters known as Lloyd's (hereafter: "the Underwriters"), having the following domicile, address and legal form:

Lloyd's
One Lime Street
London EC3M 7HA
United Kingdom

Lloyd's
Zweign
Seefeld
8008 Zu

Lloyd's Versicherer, London Head office: London / United Kingdom Zweigniederlassung für die Schweiz Legal form: Association of Underwriters

Seefeldstrasse 7 8008 Zurich

Switzerland

• In coverage disputes, claimants tend to sue either "Lloyd's, London, Zurich Branch" or the Syndicates, using either the Zurich or the London address.

### Lloyd's Underwriters as defendants



- Lloyd's recommends using "Lloyd's Underwriters London, subscribing to Police No. ...".
- Lloyd's is not the party subscribing to the policy.
- Lloyd's is not contracting party to the Policy and not contratually liable for the indemnification.
- A Lloyd's Syndicate does not have such legal capacity to act as defendant, neither under English, nor under Swiss law.
- However, if Lloyd's Underwriters are the defendants, any wrong designation of the party will usually not be challenged (e.g. Supreme Court judgment 8C\_640/2008).

07.12.2015

### Lloyd's Underwriters as claimants



- E.g. in recourse proceedings
- If the policy is governed by Swiss law:
  - By paying the indemnity the insurer becomes of the transferee of the claim of the assured against third parties.
  - The subrogating insurer initiates proceedings in its own name (no representative action as under English law).
- If the policy is governed by English law:
  - Representative action in the name of the assured

# Lloyd's Underwriters as claimants Who is the rightful claimant?



- If the Policy is governed by Swiss law?
- Judgment of the Commercial Court of Zurich of 2 June 2010, HG090242:
  - Cargo insurance policy written by 8 Syndicates
  - Instigation of recourse proceedings on behalf of these 8 Syndicates:
     "Syndicate XXX, Lloyd's of London, [address of MGA], London, United Kingdom"
  - Defendant was a carrier of perfume products and challenged legal capacity of Syndicates.
- Commercial Court refused to consider the case
  - Under English law, these 8 Syndicates did not have legal capacity.
  - Left it open whether "Lloyd's Underwriters London, subscribing to Policy No. ..."
     would meet the requirement of a legally capable party

# Lloyd's Underwriters as claimants Who is the rightful claimant?



- Supreme Court judgment of 9 November 2015, case no. 4A\_116/2015
  - Designation of Claimant:"Lloyd's Underwriters, London (subscribing to Policy No. [...]"
  - Defendant challenged legal capacity of Claimant.
  - Commercial Court of Zurich refused to consider the case.
  - Federal Supreme Court upheld the judgment of the Commercial Court.
- Who is the claimant under Swiss law?
  - Not the Syndicates
  - Not "Lloyd's Underwriters, London, subscribing to Policy No. ..."
  - Not Lloyd's itself.
  - The only parties left are the Members (may be practically difficult but still possible)
  - Other possible option: Assignment of the recourse claim to a party with legal capacity.

07.12.2015

# Lloyd's Underwriters as claimants Who is the rightful claimant?



- What if the policy is governed by English law?
  - Subrogation relates to the merits (i.e. English law)
  - Whether or not a representative action is permissible in Switzerland is usually governed by the law on the merits (i.e. English law).
  - However, the Federal Supreme Court held in case no. 4A\_740/2011 that this issue is, rather, a procedural question, and applied lex fori, i.e. Swiss law (underlying policy was governed by Scots law).
  - Claimants are either the Members or the Assureds.
  - Not yet clear.



#### **Lars Gerspacher**

Attorney-at-law, LL.M. Maritime Law (Southampton) gerspacher@gbf-legal.ch



P.O. Box 1661 Hegibachstrasse 47 8032 Zurich Switzerland

T +41 43 500 48 50 F +41 43 500 48 60

P.O. Box 1911 Route de Pré-Bois 20 1215 Geneva Airport Switzerland

T +41 22 533 48 50 F +41 22 533 48 54

contact@gbf-legal.ch www.gbf-legal.ch